EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

Jordan J. Ballor  
Executive Editor  
Journal of Markets & Morality

Robin Klay  
Professor of Economics, Emerita  
Hope College

Kenneth L. Grasso  
Professor of Political Science  
Texas State University-San Marcos

Ramón Parellada  
Treasurer  
Universidad Francisco Marroquín

Samuel Gregg  
Director of Research  
Acton Institute

Gary Quinlivan  
Dean of the Alex G. McKenna School of  
Business, Economics, and Government  
Saint Vincent College

Ian R. Harper  
Emeritus Professor  
University of Melbourne

Scott B. Rae  
Professor of Philosophy of Religion and Ethics  
Talbot School of Theology

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Maria Sophia Aguirre  
Associate Professor of Economics  
The Catholic University of America

Richard J. Mouw  
President  
Fuller Theological Seminary

James E. Alvey  
Senior Lecturer in Economics  
Massey University

Jean-Yves Naudet  
Professor of Economics  
Université d’Aix–Marseille III

Rocco Buttiglione  
Professor of Political Science  
Saint Pius V University

Michael Novak  
George Frederick Jewett Scholar in  
Religion, Philosophy, and Public Policy  
American Enterprise Institute

Christine M. Fletcher  
Assistant Professor of Theology  
Benedictine University

Paul Oslington  
Professor of Economics  
Australian Catholic University

Kim Hawtrey  
Professor of Economics  
Hope College

John Pisciotta  
Associate Professor of Economics  
Baylor University

Peter Heslam  
Director, Transforming Business  
University of Cambridge

Stan du Plessis  
Professor of Economics  
Stellenbosch University

Jesus Huerta de Soto  
Professor of Political Economy  
Universidad Rey Juan Carlos

Andrea M. Schneider  
Advisor  
Federal Chancellery, Berlin

Leonard Liggio  
Distinguished Senior Scholar  
Institute for Humane Studies

Robert A. Sirico  
President  
Acton Institute

Jude Chua Soo Meng  
Associate Professor of Philosophy, Policy  
and Leadership Studies Academic Group  
National Institute of Education,  
Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Manfred Spieker  
Professor of Christian Social Thought  
Universität Osnabrück

Andrew P. Morriss  
D. Paul Jones, Jr. and Charlene A. Jones  
Chairholder in Law and Professor of Business  
University of Alabama

Brent Waters  
Associate Professor of Christian Social Ethics  
Garrett-Evangelical Theological Seminary
Subscriptions and Customer Service

Subscriptions, hard copy back-issue orders, and customer service inquiries (renewals, address changes, and so forth) should be addressed to Customer Service.

JOURNAL OF MARKETS & MORALITY
Customer Service
161 Ottawa Northwest, Suite 301
Grand Rapids, Michigan 49503
1.800.345.2286

Or subscribe online at:
http://www.marketsandmorality.com

Individual Subscriptions

Within the United States
$25 one year (2 issues)
$45 two years (4 issues)

Outside the United States via air mail
$35 one year (2 issues)
$65 two years (4 issues)

Institutional/Library Subscriptions

Within the United States
$60 one year (2 issues)
$110 two years (4 issues)

Outside the United States via air mail
$70 one year (2 issues)
$125 two years (4 issues)

Single copies are available at $15.00 per issue for individuals and $20.00 per issue for institutions/libraries. Please add $10 for single-copy international orders.

Payment should be made by Visa or MasterCard (include account number and expiration date) or check or money order in U.S. dollars drawn on a U.S. bank. Make checks payable to ACTON INSTITUTE.

Postmaster: Please send address changes to
JOURNAL OF MARKETS & MORALITY
161 Ottawa Northwest, Suite 301
Grand Rapids, Michigan 49503

On the Cover

Beroud, Louis (1852–1930)
Central Dome of the World Fair in Paris 1889
Location: Paris, Musée Carnavalet
Source: Musée Carnavalet/
Wikimedia Commons

Contact Information

Reprint permissions, advertising, and journal exchanges:
Assistant Editor—Dylan Pahman
dpahman@acton.org

Subscriptions, renewals, and change of address corrections:
Customer Service Manager—Kimberly Brink
kbrink@acton.org

Website Coordinator—David Lohmeyer
dlohmeyer@acton.org

Art Director—Peter H. Ho
pho@acton.org

Copyediting/proofreading by Jan M. Ortiz

Interior composition by Judy Schafer

Index and Database Information

JOURNAL OF MARKETS & MORALITY is indexed in ATLA Religion, EconLit, e-JEL, JEL on CD, EBSCOhost® Electronic Journals Service (EJS)

Archives are available at:
http://www.marketsandmorality.com

Printed in the United States.

Copyright © 2011 by the Acton Institute
Contents

Editorial Articles

Marinus Ossewaarde 301 Settling the “Social Question”: Three Variants of Modern Christian Social Thought
Joseph M. de Torre 319 The Pontificate of Leo XIII (1878–1903) and the Encyclical Rerum Novarum
Manfred Spiker 327 Continuity and Res Novae in the Encyclical Letter Caritas in Veritate
Maryann O. Keating/Barry P. Keating 345 Benedict XVI as Social Realist in Caritas in Veritate
Paul Oslington 359 Caritas in Veritate and the Market Economy: How Do We Reconcile Traditional Christian Ethics with Economic Analysis of Social Systems?
Peter van Dam 373 Marching for Morals: Early Struggles in the Dutch Christian Worker Movement
Gerard van Krieken 393 Syb Talma: A Dutch Christian Socialist
Rolf van der Woude 419 Taming the Beast: The Long and Hard Road to the Christian Social Conference of 1952
David VanDrunen 445 The Two Kingdoms and the Social Order: Political and Legal Theory in Light of God’s Covenant with Noah
Eduardo J. Echeverria 463 Review Essay: The Philosophical Foundations of Bavinck and Dooyeweerd

Controversy

DOES LIBERTARIANISM TEMPT SOME CATHOLICS TO STRAY FROM CATHOLIC SOCIAL THOUGHT?

Daniel K. Finn 487 Nine Libertarian Heresies Tempting Neoconservative Catholics to Stray from Catholic Social Thought
Anthony E. Santelli II 505 “Nine Libertarian Heresies”—A Response to Daniel K. Finn
John D. Mueller 519 Finn’s “Nine Libertarian Heresies” and Mueller’s First Lemma: Economists Complain Exactly Insofar as They Are Unable to Explain
Daniel K. Finn 535 A Response to Santelli and Mueller
Anthony E. Santelli II 541 “Nine Libertarian Heresies”—A Surresponse
John D. Mueller 551 “Nine Libertarian Heresies”—A Final Surresponse
Contents

Reviews

Christian Social Thought

Kenneth P. Poirier 563 Christian Perspectives on the Financial Crash by Philip Booth (Editor)

David W. Hall 566 The Kuyper Center Review, Volume I: Politics, Religion, and Sphere Sovereignty by Gordon Graham (Editor)


Matthew Hisrich 570 Desire, Market and Religion by Jung Mo Sung

No Rising Tide: Theology, Economics, and the Future by Joerg Rieger

Edd Noell 574 Remember the Poor: Paul, Poverty, and the Greco-Roman World by Bruce W. Longenecker

Daniel J. Mahoney 577 Modern and American Dignity: Who We Are as Persons, and What Difference That Means for Our Future by Peter Augustine Lawler

Jordan J. Ballor 580 Reformed Mission in an Age of World Christianity: Ideas for the Twenty-First Century by Shirley J. Roels (Editor)

Greg Forster 583 A Public Faith by Miroslav Volf

John Halsey Wood Jr. 587 Abraham Kuyper: A Short and Personal Introduction by Richard Mouw

Ethics and Economics

Evan Miracle 589 Kapitalismus—Eine Liebeserklärung: Warum die Marktwirtschaft Uns Allen Nützt by Ulrich Chiwitt

Thomas A. Hemphill 592 Intellectual Property Law: Economic and Social Justice Perspectives by Anne Flanagan and Maria Lilla Montagnani (Editors)

Paul A. Cleveland 595 The Moral Rhetoric of Political Economy: Justice and Modern Economic Thought by Paul Turpin
Contents

PHILOSOPHY, HISTORY, AND METHODOLOGY OF ECONOMICS

Guillermo Montes 597  Looking Beyond the Individualism and Homo Economicus of Neoclassical Economics: A Collection of Original Essays Dedicated to the Memory of Peter L. Danner, Our Friend and Colleague by Edward J. O’Boyle (Editor)

Julio H. Cole 599  Milton Friedman by William Ruger

Kevin Schmiesing 601  Heavenly Merchandize: How Religion Shaped Commerce in Puritan America by Mark Valeri

Status Quaestionis

CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE FIRST CONCEPTS OF SOCIAL ECONOMY (1857)

Thomas C. Behr 607  Luigi Taparelli and a Catholic Economics

Luigi Taparelli 613  Critical Analysis of the First Concepts of Social Economy (1857)

CHRIST AND THE NEEDY (1895)

Harry Van Dyke 641  Abraham Kuyper and the Continuing Social Question

Abraham Kuyper 647  Christ and the Needy (1895)

Contributors 685
In recognition of a number of significant anniversaries occurring this year, the Journal of Markets & Morality invited submissions for this special theme issue, “Modern Christian Social Thought.” The year 2011 marks the 120th anniversary of Rerum Novarum, the encyclical from Leo XIII in 1891 that inaugurated the subsequent social encyclical tradition. This year also marks the twentieth anniversary of John Paul II’s encyclical Centesimus Annus, which was promulgated at the centenary of Rerum Novarum. In the American context, twenty-five years have passed since the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops issued their pastoral letter, “Economic Justice for All.” In addition, this year is also the 120th anniversary of the First Social Congress in Amsterdam, which has become well known as a representative of the trend of European social congresses in the last half of the nineteenth and early decades of the twentieth centuries. Abraham Kuyper, the noted Dutch theologian and statesmen, gave the opening address at this First Social Congress, a speech that set the tone for subsequent Protestant and Reformed approaches to the “social question” in light of Christian ethical reflection.

In some ways the development of these two parallel traditions of modern Christian social thought can be seen as attempts to grapple with the moral legacy of the early modern world in the context first of modernity and now postmodernity. There are some significant differences from the way in which Protestants, the Reformed tradition in particular, and the Roman Catholic Church have proceeded to address these questions over the last century. Whereas the social encyclical tradition inspired by Leo XIII with Rerum Novarum set the broad parameters
within which ensuing Catholic social teaching would develop, Protestant ethical reflection became characterized by fluidity rather than stability, cacophony rather than univocity. As James Gustafson has observed, there is “a much greater diversity in the history of Protestant ethics than in that of Roman Catholic moral theology.” Whereas Roman Catholic social teaching employs natural law as a structurally normative mode of analysis and discourse, Protestants in the twentieth century have been highly ambivalent toward such doctrines and methods. While this Protestant antipathy toward natural law has begun to dissipate, in no small part because of the efforts of Protestant ethicists such as Journal of Markets & Morality editor emeritus Stephen Grabill, there remains fertile ground for cross-fertilization between Roman Catholic and Protestant social ethical thought both on theoretical as well as practical grounds.

As the Lutheran theologian Carl Braaten writes,

Catholic moral theology has shown no such hesitation to support natural law as has generally been the case in Protestant ethics. This helps to explain why the Roman Catholic Church has produced a comprehensive body of social teachings on most issues of human concern. Even when we do not agree with the Roman Catholic application of natural law in every case of moral dispute, there is much to admire about a church that knows where it stands on the critical issues of the day and offers cogent arguments to explain its teachings.

The closest analogue to the social encyclical tradition for Protestants is the social thought coming from the ecumenical movement, whether that of mainline ecumenical bodies such as the World Council of Churches or that of the evangelical Lausanne Movement. As one might expect, the divergent social analysis amongst various Protestant groups continues to be, as Gustafson described it three decades ago, “a little short of chaos.” However, while documents such as the Accra Confession arising from the mainline ecumenical movement are troubling, there is some cause for hope. The Cape Town Commitment developed in conjunction with the Third Lausanne Congress held in South Africa in 2010 includes in its “Call to Action” a section focusing on “Truth and the Workplace” (§3), acknowledging a failure “to regard work in itself as biblically and intrinsically significant” and “to bring the whole of life under the Lordship of Christ.” The Commitment proceeds to outline significant ways to bridge this sacred-secular divide.

Even so, it is apparent that after the turn of this new century, amidst war and economic turmoil, we face problems of similar scale and scope to those faced by Christians addressing the social question at the turn of the previous century. As can be seen from the advice in and the reception of the recently released docu-
ment, “Toward Reforming the International Financial and Monetary Systems in the Context of Global Public Authority,” from the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace, there are widely divergent solutions proposed for addressing our multifaceted social maladies. It is our conviction that to answer the biblical question, “Where are you going?” we must first address its companion question, “Where have you come from?” (see Gen. 16:8). It is out of this dynamic, of looking back carefully so that we might step forward productively, that this issue of the *Journal of Markets & Morality* focuses on the last century and more of modern Christian social thought.

While we recognize that there are other significant streams of Christian social thought, such as that of the Eastern Orthodox, Lutheran, Methodist, Anabaptist, and Pentecostal traditions, the contents of this issue specifically address developments in Reformed and Roman Catholic social teaching over the course of two world wars, the fall of Soviet communism, and the phenomenon of globalization. One set of articles focuses particularly on the developments in Roman Catholic social teaching, including analysis of particular themes in individual social encyclicals, to broader questions of the interaction between moral theology and economics as a whole. Another set of articles focuses especially on Protestant approaches, including the legacy of Dutch neo-Calvinism as represented by Abraham Kuyper, Herman Bavinck, and others as a kind of case study for how a particular Protestant tradition addressed the social question in various ways and in various contexts.

As part of our continuing commitment to bring to the audience of the *Journal of Markets & Morality* the highest levels of research, we include in this issue not only these article-length studies but also a selection of book reviews on the latest scholarship at the intersection of ethics and economics. We also have been able to bring together a group of thinkers to focus in quite divergent ways on answering the question, “Does libertarianism tempt some Catholics to stray from Catholic social teaching?” This is a question with real-world application, as the recent denial of a proposal for a master’s program in Austrian economics at Loyola University New Orleans was in part attributed to “specific conflicts … between Catholic social teaching and the Austrian view of government, unions, taxations, human life and the place of Christianity in the public sector.”

We are also blessed to include in this issue translations from two significant figures in the development of Reformed and Roman Catholic social thought. Luigi Taparelli, SJ (1793–1862), is credited with influencing much subsequent Catholic social thought, notably including *Rerum Novarum*, and we present in this issue the first English translation of his work, “Critical Analysis of the First Concepts of Social Economy.” The aforementioned Reformed theologian
and statesman Abraham Kuyper (1837–1920) penned a significant set of essays examining the social implications of the gospel in the context of a political struggle over extending the franchise, “Christ and the Needy.” Both of these translations include introductions that set up the context and importance of these thinkers and their contributions, which, along with the rest of this special issue, we commend to your study and reflection.

—Jordan J. Ballor, Dr. theol. des.

Notes


3. Gustafson, Protestant and Roman Catholic Ethics, 130.

4. I explore some of the shortcomings of the social witness of the mainline ecumenical movement in my recent book, Ecumenical Babel: Confusing Economic Ideology and the Church’s Social Witness (Grand Rapids: Christian’s Library Press, 2010).